

## Veterinary Services to Support Trade

Shaping capacity-building to respond to revised international standards  
Andy Catley, December 2008



1

 Feinstein International Center

## Background

- The Pan African Programme for the Control of Epizootics (**PACE**) was a €72 million project in 32 African countries.
- Main thrust - to finalize the eradication of rinderpest from Africa and thereby *'promote economic growth through international livestock trade'*
- Also - strengthen veterinary services, with emphasis on disease surveillance systems; again, the strategy was trade-focused
- By the end of PACE in around 2004, participating countries should have taken over the costs of their disease surveillance systems

2

 Feinstein International Center

## Background (2)

- 2002 - The end of the PACE programme appeared on the horizon and rinderpest had disappeared from most African countries – but had international livestock trade improved and if not, why not?
- One reason – the other diseases listed by the Office international des epizooties (OIE) in relation to safe trade in livestock and livestock products – not only rinderpest

3

 Feinstein International Center

## Background (3)

- National commitment to veterinary services and surveillance remained weak
- Continued reliance on donor funds to support surveillance, despite substantial investments during PACE (and before)
- The emergency of HPAI programs, again with 'capacity-building' and surveillance components

4

 Feinstein International Center

## A new dialogue within AU/IBAR in 2002 – Commodity-based Trade

- Given the list of TADs at the OIE, was eradication of all of these diseases feasible in Africa?
- Given the epidemiology of these diseases, was eradication technically possible? e.g. FMD
- What has been the economic benefit of investment in disease-free zones with respect to international trade? e.g. fencing to control FMD
- Is this only an African issue? e.g. FMD in Europe

5

 Feinstein International Center

## A new dialogue within AU/IBAR – Thomson's Crazy Idea

- The WTO principle is safe trade and trade in commodities with an acceptable level of risk
- The FMD example – the virus, meat and safe trade
- Fundamental principle – the area of origin of meat need not determine whether that meat is safe to trade.

6

 Feinstein International Center

## The OIE Code and commodities ...

- Does the OIE Code allow 'commodity-based trade'?  
Yes – but the information is difficult to find and interpret
- The underlying basis of the OIE is disease eradication – the Code is structured around and prioritizes diseases, not commodities
- This approach encourages countries in Africa to focus on TAD eradication as a means to achieve safe trade

7



## Commodity-based Trade – Raising Awareness

- Thomson et al. scientific paper, 2002
- AU/IBAR Policy Brief
- AU/DFID film
- PACAPS – presentation to the COMESA Ministers of Agriculture, Seychelles, March 2008, with recommendations
- COMESA Policy Brief
- COMESA/PACAPS – liaison with EAC, IGAD
- AU/DREA Expert Consultation, May 2008
- AU/IBAR convened African Chief Veterinary Officers meeting at the OIE, Paris, May 2008

8



## Recommendations on Livestock Commodity-based Trade from the COMESA Council of Ministers of Agriculture, March 2008

- i) Member States are requested to collaborate with development partners and the Secretariat in the realization of the Commodity-based Trading System in Livestock Products, and including as a matter of urgency an emphasis on the need for revision of international standards.
- ii) Member States are requested to collaborate with COMESA to establish a Technical Working Group to develop a strategy for exploiting the commodity-based trade system to the advantage of Member States. The recommendations of the Technical Working Group should be submitted to the OIE via member state delegates to the OIE, the OIE Regional Commission for Africa and the AU's Directorate of Rural Economy and Agriculture.

*These results are PACAPS results*

9



## AU Expert Consultation, May 2008

- Dr. Ahmadu Babagana, Director, AU/DREA
- Dr. Gavin Thomson, SADC
- Dr. M. Raborokgwe, Director, Botswana Meat Commission
- Dr. Junaidu Maina, Director, Veterinary Services, Nigeria
- Dr. Stuart Hargreaves, Director, Veterinary Services, Zimbabwe
- Dr. Rebane Moerane, Director Veterinary Services, Northern Cape, South Africa
- Mr. Yacob Aklilu, Tufts University
- Dr. Andy Catley, Tufts University
- Mr. Ouseman Toure, Director General, ANSSA, Mali
- Dr. Martin Cooke, former Head of Research, TESCO UK
- Dr. Robert Connor, Anseris Ltd.

10



## AU/IBAR-convened meeting for African Chief Veterinary Officers, Paris, May 2008 at the OIE

### RECOMMENDATION No 2 Commodity Based Trade

**Acknowledging** that the current Code is based on country, zone or compartment freedom from a particular disease for the safe trade of animals and animal products,

**Considering** that Africa has numerous transboundary animal diseases, **Recognising** the abundance of wildlife in Africa,

**Noting** that transhumance is a common practice on the continent,

**Accepting** the difficulty of many African countries to achieve country, zone or compartment freedom from a variety of transboundary animal diseases,

The Regional Commission for Africa supports the OIE initiative to investigate how 'Commodity Based Trade' can be incorporated more into the Terrestrial Animal Health Code.

11



## Progress at the OIE ...

- OIE Technical Committee currently reviewing commodity-based trade issues to see if and how to modify the OIE Code to better enable the approach

12



## Market Access and FMD Control Options (from Scoones and Wolmer, 2008)

Technical options		Market access scenarios				
		High value (less)				Low value/High risk
		Higher group benefit				Lower group benefit
		EU export	Direct export to large retailers	Export to emerging markets (Asia)	Regional trade	Domestic urban markets
						Local marketing
High cost	Area based disease freedom	Status quo (high risk, high cost)				
	Export zones with vaccination	An existing option, comparable to South American competition				
	Compartmentalisation	An option to explore, for high value exports, although technical questions and distributional consequences have to be addressed				
	Commodity based trade	A key option for a broad set of high-medium value markets – not yet fully explored, but requiring investment in product safety testing and certification. Overall lower cost and risk spread.				
Low cost	Managing endemic FMD	The default – high volumes, but lower unit values. An important element of the overall picture.				

13

## Practice before policy ...

- In reality, in 2008 a number of countries are actually using some kind of commodity-based approach e.g.
  - Chilled meat exports from Ethiopia, Kenya and Somalia
  - Milk and milk powder exports from Kenya
  - Hides and skins exports

*So, is it better to strengthen these existing systems rather than direct resources to disease-free zones or eradication?*

14



## Some options for COMESA?

- Continue to raise awareness of the commodity-based approach to trade in livestock products e.g. among Chief Veterinary Officers, Ministries of Trade and private sector and civil society groups
- Promote testing of the approach within Africa: intra-African trade
- Lead a harmonized regional pro-commodity-based regional position and a common position at the OIE
- Conduct economic analyses with member states e.g. relative cost-benefit analysis of commodity-based approach vs. disease-free zones

15



## Some options for COMESA?

- Towards COMESA Green Pass for livestock for the region? for intra-African trade? for international trade?
- Explore new markets within Africa (see Yacob)
- Pluralism – regional and intraAfrican and international
- The *Codex Alimentarius* vs. the OIE Code

16



## Other issues

- Live animal exports
  - is the demand largely met in the Gulf already?
- Lack of recognized government in Somalia; limited formal representation in relevant bodies and processes

17



## Disease control – living with TADs

- TAD control will still be needed
- If CBT enables meat exports, what kind of TAD control is needed?
  - Livelihoods impacts of TADs: household level; national level
  - Basic epidemiology and economics, especially pastoralist areas
  - Surveillance systems to support TAD control rather than TAD eradication?

18



## Future capacity-building

---

In the event of clear CBT guidelines appearing in the OIE Code:

- Capacities in HACCP and certification to support CBT
- Capacities in risk analysis
- Revised short-to-medium term thinking/strategies on TAD control based on "living with TADs" and supporting epidemiological/economic analyses, leading science-based control strategies
- Design of surveillance to support TAD control objectives

19

